

STUDENT, TEACHER, LEARNER

HOW OUR EDUCATIONAL NARRATIVES SHAPE OUR LIVES

<p>Berachot 62a</p> <p>Kahana once went in and hid under Rab's bed. He heard him chatting [with his wife] and joking and doing what he required. He said to him: One would think that Abba's mouth had never sipped the dish before! He said to him: Kahana, are you here? Go out, because it is rude. He replied: It is a matter of Torah, and I require to learn.</p>	<p><u>תלמוד בבלי מסכת ברכות דף סב עמוד א</u></p> <p>רב כהנא על, גנא תותיה פורייה דרב. [נכנס ושכב תחת מיטתו] שמעיה דשח ושחק ועשה צרכיו, אמר ליה: דמי פומיה [דומה פיו] דאבא כדלא שריף תבשילא [אכל תבשיל]! אמר לו: כהנא, הכא את? פוק, דלאו ארח ארעא [צא שאין זה דרך ארץ]. אמר לו: תורה היא וללמוד אני צריך.</p>
--	--

A. Student- Teacher Relationship

<p>B. Talmud Bava Batra 21a</p> <p>In the latter clause we arrive at the case of schoolchildren who come to learn Torah in his house, and this ruling applies from the time of the ordinance of Yehoshua ben Gamla and onward.</p> <p>What was this ordinance? As Rav Yehuda says that Rav says: Truly, that man is remembered for the good, and his name is Yehoshua ben Gamla. If not for him the Torah would have been forgotten from the Jewish people. Initially, whoever had a father would have his father teach him Torah, and whoever did not have a father would not learn Torah at all. The Gemara explains: What verse did they interpret homiletically that allowed them to conduct themselves in this manner? They interpreted the verse that states: "And you shall teach them [otam] to your sons" (Deuteronomy 11:19), to mean: And you yourselves [atem] shall teach, i.e., you fathers shall teach your sons.</p> <p>When the Sages saw that not everyone was capable of teaching their children and Torah study was declining, they instituted an ordinance that teachers of children should be established in Jerusalem. The Gemara explains: What verse did they interpret homiletically</p>	<p>בבא בתרא כא.</p> <p>סיפא אתאן לתינוקות של בית רבן ומתקנת יהושע בן גמלא ואילך</p> <p>דאמר רב יהודה אמר רב ברם זכור אותו האיש לטוב ויהושע בן גמלא שמו שאלמלא הוא נשתכח תורה מישראל שבתחלה מי שיש לו אב מלמדו תורה מי שאין לו אב לא היה למד תורה מאי דרוש (דברים יא, יט) ולמדתם אותם ולמדתם אתם</p> <p>התקינו שיהיו מושיבין מלמדי תינוקות בירושלים מאי דרוש (ישעיהו ב, ג) (כי מציון תצא תורה ועדיין מי שיש לו אב היה מעלו ומלמדו מי שאין לו אב לא היה עולה ולמד התקינו שיהיו מושיבין בכל פלך ופלך ומכניסין אותן בבן ט"ז בבן י"ז</p>
---	--

that enabled them to do this? They interpreted the verse: **"For Torah emerges from Zion"** ([Isaiah 2:3](#)). But still, whoever had a father, his father ascended with him to Jerusalem and had him taught, but whoever did not have a father, he did not ascend and learn. Therefore, the Sages instituted an ordinance that teachers of children should be established in one city in each and every region [*pelekh*]. And they brought the students in at the age of sixteen and at the age of seventeen.

But as the students were old and had not yet had any formal education, a student whose teacher grew angry at him would rebel against him and leave. It was impossible to hold the youths there against their will. This state of affairs continued until Yehoshua ben Gamla came and instituted an ordinance that teachers of children should be established in each and every province and in each and every town, and they would bring the children in to learn at the age of six and at the age of seven. With regard to the matter at hand, since this system was established for the masses, the neighbors cannot prevent a scholar from teaching Torah in the courtyard.

Concerning that same issue, Rav said to Rav Shmuel bar Sheilat, a teacher of children: Do not accept a student before the age of six, as he is too young, and it is difficult for him to learn in a steady manner. From this point forward, accept him and stuff him with Torah like an ox. And Rav further said to Rav Shmuel bar Sheilat: When you strike a child for educational purposes, hit him only with the strap of a sandal, which is small and does not cause pain. Rav further advised him: He who reads, let him read on his own; whoever does not read, let him be a companion to his friends, which will encourage him to learn to read.

And Rava said: The maximum number of students for one teacher of children is twenty-

ומי שהיה רבו כועס עליו מבעיט בו ויצא עד שבא יהושע בן גמלא ותיקן שיהיו מושיבין מלמדי תינוקות בכל מדינה ומדינה ובכל עיר ועיר ומכניסין אותן בן שש בן שבע

אמר ליה רב לרב שמואל בר שילת עד שית לא תקביל מכאן ואילך קביל ואספי ליה בתורא וא"ל רב לרב שמואל בר שילת כי מחית לינוקא לא תימחי אלא בערקתא דמסנא דקארי קארי דלא קארי ליהוי צוותא לחבריה

ואמר רבא סך מקרי דרדקי עשרין וחמשה ינוקי ואי איכא חמשין מותבין תרי ואי איכא ארבעין מוקמין ריש דוכנא ומסייעין ליה ממתא

five children. And if there are fifty children in a single place, one establishes two teachers, so that each one teaches twenty-five students. And if there are forty children, one establishes an assistant, and the teacher receives help from the residents of the town to pay the salary of the assistant.

1. This is the first serious look at elementary school education in the Talmud.
2. Can you map out the three stages that it went through?
3. Fathers should be the best educators. After all they are commanded to teach their sons Torah! Why was it a flawed model back then? Why has the alternative led to a different flawed model today.
4. Who are the best students for real learning and why?

Talmud Bava Metzia 85b

Rabbi Ḥiyya said to Rabbi Ḥanina: Do you think you can debate with me? You cannot compare yourself to me, as I am acting to ensure that the Torah will not be forgotten by the Jewish people.

Rabbi Ḥiyya elaborated: **What do I do** to this end? **I go and sow flax seeds and twine nets with the flax, and then I hunt deer and feed their meat to orphans.** Next **I prepare parchment** from their hides **and I write the five books** of the Torah on them. **I go to a city and teach five children the five books**, one book per child, **and I teach six other children the six orders** of the Mishna, **and I say to them: Until I return and come here, read each other the Torah and teach each other the Mishna.** This is how I act to ensure that the Torah will not be forgotten by the Jewish people.

בבא מציעה

כי הוּוּ מִינְצוּ ר' חִינָא ור' חִיָּא אִמְר ליה ר' חִינָא לר' חִיָּא בְהֵדִי דִידִי קָא מִינְצִית ח"ו אִי מִשְׁתַּכַּח תּוֹרָה מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל מִהֲדַרְנָא לֵהּ מִפִּילְפּוּלִי אִמְר ליה ר' חִיָּא לר' חִינָא בְהֵדִי דִידִי קָא מִינְצִית דְּעַבְדִּי לְתוֹרָה דְּלֹא תִשְׁתַּכַּח מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל

מֵאִי עֲבִידְנָא אֲזִלִּינָא וְשָׂדִינָא כִּתְנָא וְגִדְלִינָא נִישְׁבִּי וְצִידְנָא טְבִי וּמֵאֲכִילָנָא בְּשִׁרְיֵהוּ לִיתְמִי וְאִרְיִכְנָא מְגִילְתָּא וּכְתִבְנָא חֲמִשָּׁה חֻמְשֵׁי וְסִלִּיקְנָא לְמִתָּא וּמִקְרִינָא חֲמִשָּׁה יְנוּקֵי בְּחִמְשָׁה חֻמְשֵׁי וּמִתְנִינָא שִׁיתָא יְנוּקֵי שִׁיתָא סְדֵרִי וְאִמְרָנָא לֵהּ עַד דְּהִדְרָנָא וְאִתִּינָא אִקְרוּ אֲהֲדִי וְאִתְּנִי אֲהֲדִי וְעַבְדִּי לֵהּ לְתוֹרָה דְּלֹא תִשְׁתַּכַּח מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל

הֵיִינוּ דְּאִמְר רַבִּי כְּמָה גְדוּלִים מַעֲשֵׂי חִיָּא אִמְר ליה ר' יִשְׁמַעֲלֵא בְר' יוֹסִי אִפִּי' מִמֶּר אִמְר ליה אִין אִפִּי' מֵאֲבָא אִמְר ליה ח"ו לֹא תֵהָא כּוֹזָת בִּישְׂרָאֵל

1. What does Rabbi Hiyya understand about education that is different than the previous two examples?
2. Who is the teacher and who is the student?
3. Could this be an effective model today?

4. Can you find a similar idea in the previous source from Bava Bathra? Who authored that idea in that earlier source?

Babylonian Talmud Eruvin 54b	ערובין נד:
<p>Having discussed the importance of reviewing one's Torah study, the Gemara relates that Rabbi Perida had a certain student whom he would have to teach four hundred times, and only then would he learn the material, as he was incapable of understanding it otherwise. One day they requested Rabbi Perida's presence for a mitzva matter after the lesson. Rabbi Perida taught his student four hundred times as usual, but this time the student did not successfully learn the material.</p> <p>Rabbi Perida said to him: What is different now that you are unable to grasp the lesson? He said to him: From the time that they said to the Master that there is a mitzva matter for which he is needed, my mind was distracted from the lesson and every moment I said: Now the Master will get up, now the Master will get up to go and perform the mitzva and he will not complete the lesson. Rabbi Perida said to him: Pay attention this time and I will teach you, and know that I will not leave until you have fully mastered the lesson. He taught him again an additional four hundred times.</p> <p>Due to the merit of Rabbi Perida's great devotion to his students, a Divine Voice emerged and said to him: Is it preferable to you that four hundred years be added to your life, or that you and the rest of your generation will merit the World-to-Come? He said: I prefer that I and my generation merit the World-to-Come. The Holy One, Blessed be He, said to the angels: Give him both; he shall live a very long life and he and the rest of his generation will merit the World-to-Come.</p>	<p>רבי פרידא הוה ליה ההוא תלמידא דהוה תני ליה ארבע מאה זימני וגמר יומא חד בעיוה למלתא דמצוה תנא ליה ולא גמר</p> <p>אמר ליה האידנא מאי שנא אמר ליה מדהיא שעתא דאמר ליה למר איבא מילתא דמצוה אסחאי לדעתאי וכל שעתא אמינא השתא קאי מר השתא קאי מר אמר ליה הב דעתיק ואתני לך הדר תנא ליה ארבע מאה זימני [אחריני]</p>

1. The word Perida means separation. What does the teacher's name already prepare us for?
2. Why is the student unable to learn on this particular day? Think a little more deeply about the relationship between student and teacher which resembles in many ways the relationship between parent and child.

3. Was Rabbi Perida at fault and if so, what was the fault?
4. What did he learn about himself that makes him an outstanding educator?

<p>Babylonian Talmud Taanit 25a The Gemara relates a similar incident. Rav happened to come to a certain place where he decreed a fast but rain did not come. The prayer leader descended to lead the service before him and recited: He Who makes the wind blow, and the wind blew. He continued and said: And Who makes the rain fall, and the rain came. Rav said to him: What are your good deeds? He said to him: I am a teacher of children, and I teach the Bible to the children of the poor as to the children of the rich, and if there is anyone who cannot pay, I do not take anything from him. And I have a fishpond, and any child who neglects his studies, I bribe him with the fish and calm him, and soothe him until he comes and reads.</p>	<p>תענית כה. רב איקלע להווא אתרא, גזר תעניתא ולא אתא מיטרא. נחית קמיה שליחא דצבורא, אמר משיב הרוח ונשב זיקא, אמר מוריד הגשם - ואתא מיטרא, אמר ליה: מאי עובדך? - אמר ליה: מיקרי דרדקי אנא ומקרינא לבני עניי. כבני עתירי, וכל דלא אפשר ליה לא שקלינא מיניה מידי. ואית לי פירא דכוורי, וכל מאן דפשע - משחדינא ליה מיניה, ומסדרין ליה, ומפייסין ליה, עד דאתי וקרי.</p>
---	---

1. Who is the teacher and who is the student in this story?
2. What does this story tell us about the character of Rav? Can you point to a
3. What kind of educator is the unnamed prayer leader? How does this contrast to Rav who is the head of the Talmudical academy?
4. What does this story teach us about education?

<p>Babylonian Talmud Bava Metzia 86 The Gemara relates: One day, Rabbi Yoḥanan was bathing in the Jordan River. Reish Lakish saw him and jumped into the Jordan, pursuing him. At that time, Reish Lakish was the leader of a band of marauders. Rabbi Yoḥanan said to Reish Lakish: Your strength is fit for Torah study. Reish Lakish said to him: Your beauty is fit for women. Rabbi Yoḥanan said to him: If you return to the pursuit of Torah, I will give you my sister in marriage, who is more beautiful than I am. Reish Lakish accepted upon himself to study Torah. Subsequently, Reish Lakish wanted to jump back out of the river to bring back his clothes, but he was unable to return, as he had lost his physical strength as</p>	<p>בבא מציעה פו. יומא חד הוה קא סחי רבי יוחנן בירדנא, חזייה ריש לקיש ושוור לירדנא אבתריה, אמר ליה: חילך לאורייתא! - אמר ליה: שופרך לנשי! - אמר ליה: אי הדרת בך - יהיבנא לך אחותי, דשפירא מינאי. קביל עליה. בעי למיהדר לאתווי מאניה - ולא מצי הדר. אקרייה ואתנייה, ושוויה גברא רבא.</p>
---	---

soon as he accepted the responsibility to study Torah upon himself.

Rabbi Yoḥanan **taught** Reish Lakish **Bible, and taught him Mishna, and turned him into a great man.** Eventually, Reish Lakish became one of the outstanding Torah scholars of his generation.

One day the Sages of the study hall were **engaging in a dispute** concerning the following *baraita*: With regard to **the sword, the knife, the dagger [vehapigyon], the spear, a hand sickle, and a harvest sickle, from when are they susceptible to ritual impurity?** The *baraita* answers: It is **from the time of the completion of their manufacture**, which is the *halakha* with regard to metal vessels in general.

These Sages inquired: **And when is the completion of their manufacture?** Rabbi Yoḥanan says: It is **from when one fires** these items **in the furnace.** Reish Lakish said: It is **from when one scours them in water**, after they have been fired in the furnace. Rabbi Yoḥanan said to Reish Lakish: **A bandit knows about his banditry**, i.e., you are an expert in weaponry because you were a bandit in your youth. Reish Lakish said to Rabbi Yoḥanan: **What benefit did you provide me** by bringing me close to Torah? **There**, among the bandits, **they called me: Leader of the bandits, and here, too, they call me: Leader of the bandits.** Rabbi Yoḥanan said to him: **I provided benefit to you, as I brought you close to God, under the wings of the Divine Presence.**

As a result of the quarrel, Rabbi Yoḥanan was **offended**, which in turn affected Reish Lakish, who **fell ill.** Rabbi Yoḥanan's sister, who was Reish Lakish's wife, **came crying** to Rabbi Yoḥanan, begging that he pray for Reish Lakish's recovery. **She said to him: Do this for the sake of my children**, so that they should have a father. Rabbi Yoḥanan said to her the verse: **"Leave your fatherless children, I will rear them"** (Jeremiah 49:11), i.e., I will take care of them. She said to him: **Do so for the sake of my widowhood.** He said to her the rest of the verse: **"And let your widows trust in Me."**

יומא חד הוו מפלגי בי מדרשא: הסייף והסכין והפגיון והרומח ומגל יד ומגל קציר מאימתי מקבלין טומאה - משעת גמר מלאכתן, ומאימתי גמר מלאכתן?

רבי יוחנן אומר: משיצרפם בכבשן, ריש לקיש אמר: משיצחצחן במים. - אמר ליה: לסטאה בלסטיותיה ידע! - אמר ליה: ומאי אהנת לי? התם רבי קרו לי, הכא רבי קרו לי. אמר ליה: אהנאי לך דאקרבינך תחת כנפי השכינה.

חלש דעתיה דרבי יוחנן, חלש ריש לקיש. אתאי אחתיה קא בכיא, אמרה ליה: עשה בשביל בני! אמר לה: עזבה יתמיך אני אחיה. - עשה בשביל אלמנותי! - אמר לה: ואלמנותיך עלי תבטחו.

Ultimately, **Rabbi Shimon ben Lakish**, Reish Lakish, **died**. **Rabbi Yoḥanan was sorely pained over losing him**. **The Rabbis said: Who will go to calm Rabbi Yoḥanan's mind and comfort him over his loss?** They said: **Let Rabbi Elazar ben Pedat go, as his statements are sharp**, i.e., he is clever and will be able to serve as a substitute for Reish Lakish.

Rabbi Elazar ben Pedat **went and sat before** Rabbi Yoḥanan. With regard to **every matter that Rabbi Yoḥanan would say**, Rabbi Elazar ben Pedat would **say to him**: There is a ruling which is **taught in abaraita that supports your opinion**.

Rabbi Yoḥanan said to him: **Are you comparable to the son of Lakish?** In my discussions with **the son of Lakish, when I would state a matter, he would raise twenty-four difficulties against me** in an attempt to disprove my claim, **and I would answer him with twenty-four answers, and the halakha by itself would become broadened and clarified**. **And yet you say to me**: There is a ruling which is **taught in abaraita that supports your opinion**. **Do I not know that what I say is good?** Being rebutted by Reish Lakish served a purpose; your bringing proof to my statements does not.

Rabbi Yoḥanan **went around, rending his clothing, weeping and saying**: **Where are you, son of Lakish? Where are you, son of Lakish?** Rabbi Yoḥanan **screamed until his mind was taken from him**, i.e., he went insane. **The Rabbis prayed and requested for God to have mercy on him and take his soul, and Rabbi Yoḥanan died**.

נח נפשיה דרבי שמעון בן לקיש, והוה קא מצטער רבי יוחנן בתריה טובא. אמרו רבנן: מאן ליזיל ליתביה לדעתיה - ניזיל רבי אלעזר בן פדת, דמחדדין שמעתיה.

אזל יתיב קמיה, כל מילתא דהוה אמר רבי יוחנן אמר ליה: תניא דמסייעא לך. אמר: את כבר לקישא? בר לקישא, כי

הוה אמינא מילתא - הוה מקשי לי עשרין וארבע קושייתא, ומפרקינא ליה עשרין וארבעה פרוקי, וממילא רווחא שמעתא.

ואת אמרת תניא דמסייע לך, אטו לא ידענא דשפיר קאמינא? הוה קא אזיל וקרע מאניה, וקא בכי ואמר: היבא את בר לקישא, היבא את בר לקישא, והוה קא צוח עד דשף דעתיה [מיניה]. בעו רבנן רחמי עליה ונח נפשיה.

1. In this very famous story, I want you to focus on the dynamic between Rabbi Yochanan the teacher and Reish Lakish the student.
2. How does Reish Lakish become Rabbi Yochanan's student?
3. What happens when the student becomes equal or surpasses his student?
4. What tragic consequence comes about as a result of this rupture? Why?
5. What does Rabbi Yochanan understand about the relationship between student and teacher at the end?

B. God as Teacher Student and Learner

Babylonian Talmud Menachot 29a

§ Rav Yehuda says that Rav says: When Moses ascended on High, he found the Holy One, Blessed be He, sitting and tying crowns on the letters of the Torah.

Moses said before God: **Master of the Universe, who is preventing You** from giving the Torah without these additions? God said to him: **There is a man who is destined to be born after several generations, and Akiva ben Yosef is his name; he is destined to derive from each and every thorn of these crowns mounds upon mounds of halakhot.** It is for his sake that the crowns must be added to the letters of the Torah.

Moses said before God: **Master of the Universe, show him to me.** God said to him: **Return behind you.** Moses went and sat at the end of the eighth row in Rabbi Akiva's study hall and did not understand what they were saying. Moses' strength waned, as he thought his Torah knowledge was deficient.

When Rabbi Akiva arrived at the discussion of one matter, his students said to him: **My teacher, from where do you derive this?** Rabbi Akiva said to them: It is a **halakha** transmitted to Moses from Sinai. When Moses heard this, his mind was put at ease, as this too was part of the Torah that he was to receive.

מנחות כט.

אמר רב יהודה אמר רב: בשעה שעלה משה למרום, מצאו להקב"ה שיושב וקושר כתרים לאותיות, אמר לפניו: רבש"ע, מי מעכב על ידך? אמר לו: אדם אחד יש שעתיד להיות בסוף כמה דורות ועקיבא בן יוסף שמו, שעתיד לדרוש על כל קוץ וקוץ תילין תילין של הלכות. אמר לפניו: רבש"ע, הראהו לי, אמר לו: חזור לאחורך. הלך וישב בסוף שמונה שורות, ולא היה יודע מה הן אומרים, תשש כחו; כיון שהגיע לדבר אחד, אמרו לו תלמידיו: רבי, מניין לך? אמר להן: הלכה למשה מסיני, נתיישבה דעתו. חזר ובא לפני הקדוש ברוך הוא, אמר לפניו: רבונו של עולם, יש לך אדם כזה ואתה נותן תורה ע"י? אמר לו: שתוק, כך עלה במחשבה לפני. אמר לפניו: רבונו של עולם, הראיתני תורתך, הראני שכר, אמר לו: חזור [לאחורך]. חזר לאחוריו, ראה ששוקלין בשחו במקולין, אמר לפניו: רבש"ע, זו תורה וזו שכרה? א"ל: שתוק, כך עלה במחשבה לפני.

1. I want to suggest that God acts as teacher – educator in this story. How do you see that in the first part of the story?
2. Why is Moshe, the first teacher of Torah, so threatened by Rabbi Akiba?
3. What puts his mind at ease? How can this be an insight into what helps people find resilience?

Bamidbar Rabbah 19

Rabbi Acha in the name of Rabbi Chanina said: At the time when Moses ascended to the heavenly heights, he heard the voice of the Holy One. Blessed be He who was sitting and studying the Torah portion of the Red Heifer and uttering a halakha in the name of the one

במדבר רבה פרשת יט

רבי אחא בשם רבי חנינא אמר בשעה שעלה משה למרום, שמע קולו של הקדוש ברוך הוא שיושב ועוסק בפרשת פרה אדמה ואומר הלכה בשם אומרה, רבי אליעזר אומר עגלה בת שנתיים ופרה בת שתיים. אמר לפניו רבון העולמים יהי רצון שיהא מחלצי, אמר לו חייך שהוא מחלצי, הדיא הוא דכתיב (שמות יח, ט): ושם האחד אליעזר, שם אותו המיחד.

who spoke of it. Rabbi Eliezer said a calf is one year old and a cow is two year old.
Moses said before Him: Master of the Universe! May it be Your will that he (Rabbi Eliezer) would be from my loins.
God said to him: By your life he is from your loins. For so it says in Scripture...and the name of the other son of Moses was Eliezer...the same particular name.

1. **God is portrayed here as a student. What does this tell us about God's relationship to Torah and those who study it once it descends to the world from Sinai?**
2. **If you could teach God Torah, what would you choose to teach?**

Song of Songs 3

Even upon the crown wherewith his mother has crowned him. R. Yochanan said: R. Siemon b. Yohai asked R. Eleazar b. R. Jose: Have you perhaps heard from your father what is the meaning of the crown...? He replied Yes. How did he explain it? He asked. He said: "By a parable of a king who had an only daughter of whom he was exceedingly fond so that at first he called her daughter till not satisfied with that he called her sister and still not satisfied with that he called her mother.
So the Holy One blessed be He loved Israel exceedingly and called them daughter as it says "Hearken O daughter and consider (Tehillim 65,2); till not satisfied with that he called them 'sister' as it says Open to me my sister my love (S.S. v2): and still not satisfied with that He called them mother as it says Attend unto Me O My people and give ear unto Me, O My nation (Isa. 51,4) where it is written ul'immi (and to my mother). R. Simeon b. Yoahi rose and kissed him on his head, saying "had I come only to hear this explanation from your lips it would have repaid me."

שיר השירים רבה (וילנא) פרשה ג

ב בעטרה שעטרה לו אמו, א"ר יוחנן שאל רשב"י את רבי אלעזר ברבי יוסי אמר לו אפשר ששמעת מאביך מהו בעטרה שעטרה לו אמו, אמר לו הן, אמר לו היאך, אמר לו למלך שהיתה לו בת יחידה והיה מחבבה יותר מדאי והיה קורא אותה בתי ולא זז מחבבה עד שקרא אותה אחותי ולא זז מחבבה עד שקרא אותה אמי, כך היה מחבב יותר מדאי הקדוש ברוך הוא לישראל וקראן בתי הה"ד (תהלים מ"ה) שמעי בת וראי, ולא זז מחבב עד שקראן אחותי שנא' (שיר/השירים/ה') פתחי לי אחותי רעיתי, ולא זז מחבב עד שקראן אמי שנא' (ישעיה נ"א) הקשיבו אלי עמי ולאומי אלי האזינו, ולאמי כתיב, עמד רשב"י ונשקו על ראשו ואמר אלו לא באתי אלא לשמוע מפיו הטעם הזה דיי

1. **There are three female relationships presented here: daughter, sister, mother. Try to think about the differences between each and why the king moves from one to another in order to find an expression for his closeness to his daughter.**
2. **What is unique about mother?**

3. If we take this metaphor towards God and the children of Israel, why would God look at Israel as Mother? What does this tell us about God's need for us?

Rabbi Perida who listens to his student and learned from him about himself and about the relationship between student and teacher

Rav – taught rich and poor alike – equal opportunity in education and the fishpond – different students are different learners. There is not one paradigm.

Rabbi Hiyya – teaching students to pass on the information – not just memorize but internalize

Rabbi Yehoshua ben Gamla – how to set up an education system – and bring it to Sarah Schnirer

Resh Lakish and Rabbi Yochanan – What happens when the student becomes a teacher? My identity is teacher and his is student and now that narrative is changing, shifting. How do we respond.

Moshe and Rabbi Akiva – what happens when our purpose no longer seems relevant? Can we find ourselves nonetheless part of the chain that has led to the future? God helps Moshe find resilience.

Honi – what happens when our narrative is taken away from us? Compare Bavli and Yerushalmi

God is learning from Rabbi Eliezer = how to read Para Aduma. What is God like as a learner or student? How are we teachers of God? By learning and interpreting Torah. God learns from us. Incredible idea. Do we shape God's narrative?

Palestinian Talmud Taanit 3:5-9

Rabbi Yudon ben Geira said: This Honi the Roof-Roller is the grandson of Honi the Roof-Roller who lived close to the destruction of the First Temple. He went out to his workers in the fields. **While he was there it rained.** He went into a cave and sat down, became drowsy and fell asleep and slept for 70 years until the first temple was destroyed and the second temple was rebuilt. After 70 years he awoke from his sleep. He went out from his cave and saw a changed world. A place that was a vineyard had become an olive grove. A place that was an olive grove had become a sown field. He asked, what is going on in the world. They said, do you not know what is going on in the world? He said, No.

They said to him, Who are you? He said to them, Honi the Roof-Roller. They said to him: We have heard that when he would go into the courtyard of the Temple it would become light. He went into the courtyard and it became light. He applied to himself the verse "When the Lord brought back those who returned to Zion, we were like dreamers."

תלמוד ירושלמי (וילנא) מסכת תענית פרק ג

א"ר יודן גיריא הדין חונה המעגל בר בריה דחוני המעגל הוה סמיך לחרבן בית מוקדשא נפק לטורא לגבי פעליי עד דו תמן נחת מיטרא עאל ליה למערתא מן יתיב נם ודמך ליה ועבד שקיע בשינתיה שובעין שנין עד דחרב בית מוקדשא ואיתבני זמן תינינות. לסוף שובעין שנין איתער מן שינתיה נפק ליה מן מערתא וחמא עלמא מחלף זוויי דהוות כרמי' עבידא זייתין זוויי דהוות זייתין עבידא זרעו. שאל ליה למדינתא אמר לון מה קלא בעלמא אמרון ליה ולית את ידע מה קלא בעלמא אמר לון לא. אמרין ליה מאן את אמר לון חוני המעגל. אמרון ליה שמענן דהוה עליל לעזרה והיא מנהרה עאל ואנהרת וקרא על גרמיה [תהילים קבו א] בשוב ה' את שיבת ציון היינו כחלמים

R. Johanan said: This righteous man [Honi] was throughout the whole of his life troubled about

אמר רבי יוחנן: כל ימיו של אותו צדיק היה מצטער על מקרא זה שיר המעלות בשוב ה' את שיבת ציון היינו

the meaning of the verse, A Song of Ascents, When the Lord brought back those that returned to Zion, we were like unto them that dream. Is it possible for a man to dream continuously for seventy years? One day he was journeying on the road and he saw a man planting a carob tree; he asked him, How long does it take [for this tree] to bear fruit? The man replied: Seventy years. He then further asked him: Are you certain that you will live another seventy years? The man replied: I found [ready grown] carob trees in the world; as my forefathers planted these for me so I too plant these for my children.

Honi sat down to have a meal and sleep overcame him. As he slept a rocky formation enclosed upon him which hid him from sight and he continued to sleep for seventy years. When he awoke he saw a man gathering the fruit of the carob tree and he asked him, Are you the man who planted the tree? The man replied: I am his grandson. Thereupon he exclaimed: It is clear that I slept for seventy years. He then caught sight of his ass who had given birth to several generations of mules; and he returned home. He there enquired, Is the son of Honi the Circle-Drawer still alive? The people answered him, His son is no more, but his grandson is still living. Thereupon he said to them: I am Honi the Circle-Drawer, but no one would believe him. He then repaired to the Beth Hamidrash and there he overheard the scholars say, The law is as clear to us as in the days of Honi the Circle-Drawer, for whenever he came to the Beth Hamidrash he would settle for the scholars any difficulty that they had. Whereupon he called out, I am he; but the scholars would not believe him nor did they give him the honour due to him. This hurt him greatly and he prayed [for death] and he died.

Raba said: Hence the saying, Either companionship or death.

כחולמים. אמר: מי איכא דניימ שבעין שנין בחלמא? יומא חד הוה אזל באורחא, חזייה לההוא גברא דהוה נטע חרובא, אמר ליה: האי, עד כמה שנין טעין? - אמר ליה: עד שבעין שנין. - אמר ליה: פשיטא לך דחייית שבעין שנין? - אמר ליה: האי [גברא] עלמא בחרובא אשכחתי, כי היכי דשתלי לי אבהתי - שתלי נמי לבראי. יתיב, קא כריך ריפתא, אתא ליה שינתא, נים. אהדרא ליה משוניתא, איכסי מעינא, ונימ שבעין שנין. כי קם חזייה לההוא גברא דהוה קא מלקט מינייהו. אמר ליה: את הוא דשתלתיה? - אמר ליה: בר בריה אנא. אמר ליה: שמע מינה דניימי שבעין שנין. חזא לחמריה דאתיילידא ליה רמכי רמכי. אזל לביתיה, אמר להו: בריה דחוני המעגל מי קיים? - אמרו ליה: בריה ליתא, בר בריה איתא. אמר להו: אנא חוני המעגל. לא הימנוהו. אזל לבית המדרש, שמעינהו לרבנן דקאמרי: נהירן שמעתין כבשני חוני המעגל, דכי הוי עייל לבית מדרשא, כל קושיא דהוו להו לרבנן הוה מפרק להו. אמר להו: אנא ניהו, ולא הימנוהו, ולא עבדי ליה יקרא כדמבעי ליה, חלש דעתיה, בעי רחמי ומית. אמר רבא, היינו דאמרי אינשי: או חברותא או מיתותא.

Teacher Bio

THE PARDES INSTITUTE OF JEWISH STUDIES is an open, inclusive, diverse and intellectually challenging Jewish learning community based in Jerusalem with programs worldwide. Pardes cultivates a life-long love of Jewish learning, the Jewish people and Israel. Pardes inspires engagement in Jewish life — as communal and spiritual leaders, educators and active participants. For more information see www.pardes.org.il.